

Amalia L. Cabezas

Between Love and Money: Sex, Tourism, and Citizenship in Cuba and the Dominican Republic

Gee, and I used to settle for a mint on my pillow.

—Comment from a recent traveler to Cuba on a sexual proposition that he received from a hotel chambermaid

Sex, travel, and globalization, all of which characterize the tourism industry today, are nothing new to the Caribbean region. Its history is steeped in processes that interconnect all three within the political order. Sexual conquest and exploitation were of paramount importance to the European colonizers, who raped and looted their way through the Americas. Early on, sex was tied into economic and social processes, from the breeding of slaves, trafficking in women, and hiring of wet nurses to the use of concubines and prostitutes. For more than five hundred years, the sexual labor of women has been embedded in the normal operation of political and economic structures in this part of the world (Kempadoo 1999).

Moreover, the growing integration of states, markets, ideas, and communication across borders is nothing new to the Caribbean region. Probably to a larger extent than any other area, the region has been fully integrated into, and dependent on, the world economy for centuries (Wood 2000; Freeman 2001). The question to ask, therefore, is what is

I am grateful to Alicia Arrizón and Marguerite Waller for inviting me to participate in the "Sexuality and Knowledges" Conference at the University of California, Riverside, from which this article emerged. Versions of this article were also presented at the University of California, Santa Cruz, and Wayne State University, Detroit, where audiences provided insightful comments. Antonia I. Castañeda, Alfredo Cruz, Raúl Fernández, Gisela Fosado, Christine Gailley, Nancy A. Hewitt, Arturo Madrid, Nancy Paige Fernández, Elizabeth Forsyth, Bernardo Useche, and Georgia Warnke provided valuable feedback, ongoing support, and encouragement. Thanks to Patrick Alcedo for excellent research assistance. My sincere appreciation to the editors of *Signs* and two anonymous reviewers for their thoughtful suggestions. I dedicate this article to the memory of my mother, Maria Josefa Cabezas Piñeiro.

[*Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 2004, vol. 29, no. 4]

© 2004 by The University of Chicago. All rights reserved. 0097-9740/2004/2904-0007\$10.00

new about this stage of capitalism? Or, more specifically, what is new about global sex? How does globalization create the conditions within which sexual acts and sexualized identities develop?

Drawing on fieldwork with sex trade participants in Cuba and the Dominican Republic, in this article I examine some of the new manifestations of sexual commerce.¹ While there are many differences between these two Caribbean nations, this article concentrates primarily on their commonalities. Nevertheless, a few comments are in order to highlight some features of the two contexts. Certainly the most glaring and profound difference is Cuba's adherence to a centrally planned government that espouses socialist principles. At the beginning of the twentieth century both countries were under U.S. hegemonic control—characterized by periodic military intervention and occupation, loss of national autonomy, and the bolstering of brutal political regimes. In 1959 Cuba broke off to become the first socialist country in the Western hemisphere. This challenge to U.S. capital and strategic interests was to influence the growth of the Dominican tourist industry and prompt the assassination of its “butcher” dictator, Rafael Trujillo (Atkins and Wilson 1998).²

The Dominican economy for the past twenty years has increasingly moved toward the implementation of neoliberal, free-market reforms. Af-

¹ I conducted unstructured, open-ended interviews and participant observations in two of the major tourist destinations in Cuba: Varadero, the largest and oldest tourist resort on the island, and Havana. This research took place over the course of intermittent visits to Cuba from 1995 to 2002, lasting from two weeks to one month. I interviewed thirty women between ages twenty and thirty-nine; only five consented to a tape-recorded interview. The research for the Dominican Republic was conducted in 1996 and 1997 in the Puerto Plata region. I interviewed thirty-five women. All interviews were tape-recorded. The local sex worker organization, *Movimiento de Mujeres Unidas*, and a nongovernmental organization, *Centro de Promoción y Solidaridad Humana (CEPROSH)*, made the initial contact with informants. Informed consent, anonymity, and confidentiality were guaranteed to all participants in this research project. Accordingly, in this article all names have been changed. In both countries, I conducted informal conversations with hotel workers, tour guides, taxi drivers, restaurant workers, hotel guests, tourists, travel agents, academics, entertainers, and religious leaders.

² Tourism development is not a “voluntary” development option; rather, it is structurally linked to the stipulations of international capital. The United Nations’ UNESCO, the World Bank, and the Organization of American States pressured the Dominican Republic to build its tourist infrastructure after the United States lost access to Cuba’s tourism market (Barry, Wood, and Preusch 1984; Miolán 1994; Lladó 1996). Through its development packages the World Bank provided loans and technical guidance to transform the structure of the economy and capture the surplus income and investments of developed nations. The number of tourists arriving in the Dominican Republic grew from 63,000 in 1970 to 2.6 million in 1999 (WTO 2000).

ter being ravaged during the 1980s by structural adjustment programs imposed by the International Monetary Fund, coupled with mismanagement and corruption, the economy showed high rates of growth during the 1990s (Wiarda 1999). Procedural democracy has endured despite mass protests, riots, and social instability, thereby strengthening the fragile democratic process in the country (Espinal 1995). However, with a population of 8.6 million, close to 30 percent of Dominicans continue to live in poverty (World Bank 2000). A World Bank report comments that the Dominican Republic is notable in Latin America as the country that allocates the lowest share of its public capital to education, health, and public safety (World Bank 2000).³ This is an important distinction between the Dominican Republic and Cuba.

At the end of the 1980s, the collapse of the Soviet Union and the socialist trading bloc obliged Cuba to move quickly from state-controlled central planning to a mixed-market economy that emphasizes social welfare. As with its neoliberal Dominican neighbor, the Cuban state has implemented neoclassical economic reforms, including the general retrenchment of the state, a move toward export-oriented zones, implementation of incentives to attract foreign capital, privatization of utilities, and labor restructuring (Susman 1998). Notwithstanding these radical and contradictory changes, the state has continued to support an infrastructure that stresses social well-being and that acts as a safety net for the most vulnerable segments of society. As Paul Susman asserts, "what makes the Cuban response to crisis conditions so interesting is that it appears to accept many capitalist economic practices, but with restrictions aimed at maintaining its commitment to socialism" (Susman 1998, 185). Despite a tightening of the U.S. embargo that has caused resource scarcities, epidemics, and shortages of food and medicine, Cuba has held fast to its health and educational programs, continuing to make them universally available. According to the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, "social indicators for Cuba continue to be outstanding in comparison to the regional average, despite the economic difficulties the country has been experiencing since 1989."⁴ But the dollarization of the economy has spawned new social classes and inequality, which for the first time in more than forty years have fueled the rein-

³ The World Bank notes that high levels of unemployment, illiteracy, child labor, malnutrition, and unsafe drinking water are ordinary aspects of the lives of the poorest segments of society (World Bank 2000).

⁴ Approximately 52 percent of the national budget goes toward basic services (Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean 1999).

production of two vile vestiges of the old capitalist social order—internal prostitution among Cubans and the reinstitution of domestic services. The rapid move to a mixed-market system during the past ten years, coupled with the dollarization of the economy, has resulted in an inverted social pyramid that privileges workers in the tourist industries over professionals in all other economic sectors.

Despite these important differences, my aim is to demonstrate similar economic and social outcomes that stem from the adoption of international tourism—or the four S's, as they are known in the literature: sun, sea, sand, and sex—to create economic growth. First, I argue that the link between tourism and the sex trade points to the flexible reorganization of the labor process through the creation of seasonal work, the proliferation of informal market arrangements, and the erosion of boundaries between the formal and informal sectors of the economy.⁵ These changes are related not only to the reorganization of labor but also to new patterns in the social organization of personal romance. Second, I argue that workers consequently inform, shape, and challenge the labor process through their use of intimacy and sexuality and that they contest and defy uncomplicated categorizations of sex tourism. Third, I discuss how the elusiveness that exists in practices and perceptions of sex tourism is mirrored in the juridical framework and its enforcement as well as in how questions of sexual morality inform definitions of sexual citizenship. Finally, I offer some preliminary thoughts on an alternative to the prevalent paradigm that characterizes all sex tourism as sex work.

During the last decade, a number of studies have examined the sexual relationships between hosts and guests in the Caribbean's international tourism industry.⁶ The development of the literature has brought important insights into the dynamics of globalization in tourist resorts (Brennan 1998), sex tourism and globalization (Wonders and Michalowski 2001), typologies of sex tourists (Davidson 1996), gay sex tourism (Puar 2001), country studies that map sex tourism in various Caribbean countries (Kempadoo 1999), and the interaction between male sex workers and North American and European women.⁷

More recently, a number of researchers have begun to register their

⁵ Portes, Castells, and Benton 1989; Portes and Schauffler 1993; Sassen 1998; Freeman 2000.

⁶ Pruitt and LaFont 1995; Davidson 1996; Albuquerque 1998; Brennan 1998; Cabezas 1998; Kempadoo 1999; Sánchez Taylor 2001.

⁷ Pruitt and LaFont 1995; Albuquerque 1998; Herold, García, and De Moya 2001; Sánchez Taylor 2001.

displeasure with the approaches and categories utilized in the literature.⁸ For example, Martin Oppermann (1999), Chris Ryan (2000), and Edward Herold, Rafael García, and Tony De Moya (2001) critique studies that essentialize all sex tourism as a form of victimization. Others challenge studies that posit sex tourism and romance tourism as mutually exclusive (Albuquerque 1998; Herold, García, and De Moya 2001; Sánchez Taylor 2001). Oppermann argues that sex tourism is only perceived when the main motivation is travel with the purpose of purchasing sexual services, effectively ignoring commercial sex attached to conference and business travel or other types of travel (Oppermann 1999, 252).⁹ Ryan adds that sex tourism is "mostly undefined" (Ryan 2000, 19). Likewise, Oppermann (1999) and Herold, García, and De Moya (2001) decry the scholarship that narrowly defines sex tourism as an exchange of money for sex. By drawing on fieldwork based in Cuba and the Dominican Republic, this article extends these challenges to the literature on sex tourism.

This article also contributes to this growing body of literature on tourism and sex work in the Caribbean. For one, all of the studies thus far have focused primarily on relationships that are spatially discernible and public. These encounters attract attention because they are highly public and involve participants from different racial-ethnic and class backgrounds. Generally, most studies have examined relations between otherwise unemployed "freelance workers" or beach boys in tourist centers.¹⁰ They overlook on-the-job tourism workers as participants in the sex trade. Yet these workers are accessible and in constant and intimate contact with tourists. By analyzing relations between hotel workers and guests, I argue in this study that the prevalent social-labor realities underscore the need for a more complex analytical framework to account for the fluid arrangements taking place between "hosts and guests." Furthermore, most studies have assumed, in advance, to know who is a sex worker and what counts as sex work. Although the literature has begun to challenge studies that narrowly define sex tourism as solely involving monetary exchange, the

⁸ Albuquerque 1998; Oppermann 1999; Ryan 2000; Herold, García, and De Moya 2001; Sánchez Taylor 2001.

⁹ Oppermann (1999), Herold, García, and De Moya (2001), and Sánchez Taylor (2001) also reproach the research studies for ignoring sexual relations between female tourists and male sex workers. However, male sex workers are widely represented in the literature of the Caribbean. See De Moya et al. 1992; Pruitt and LaFont 1995; Phillips 1999; and Sánchez Taylor 2001, all of whom have examined the interpersonal relations of local males and female tourists.

¹⁰ Pruitt and LaFont 1995; Albuquerque 1998; Oppermann 1999; Ryan 2000; Herold, García, and De Moya 2001; Sánchez Taylor 2001.

category of sex worker has remained unexamined and immutable within sex tourism research. If we account for spatial factors and assumptions based on race, sexuality, and class, the "sex worker" category loses its stable meaning. In this study I propose a more complicated approach that accounts for the provisional practices and identities that constitute sexual markets and that envelop understandings of labor and sex as more a matter of continua than a hard and fast definition.

Tourism and new patterns of sexual labor

The tourism industry is the primary economic development strategy in both Cuba and the Dominican Republic, creating local direct employment as well as a number of other multiplier effects within both countries (Harrison 1992).¹¹ Identified as the most significant "social impact" of tourism, tourist-oriented prostitution, known as sex tourism, is a growing phenomenon with far-reaching social, political, and economic implications for countries that depend heavily on tourism. Both tourism and remittances represent the major earnings for the state, signifying a continual reliance on former colonial powers and outside forces for economic stability.¹²

The lack of viable work and the dependence on foreign exchange drive young men and women to migrate to tourist areas to earn a living. Sex with tourists is one of a broad spectrum of services and activities in which people engage to procure earnings. But sex tourism is not just about sex and money; it is about other kinds of opportunities as well. Liaisons with tourists provide recourse to get by and to get ahead: not just to supplement low wages but also to procure opportunities for recreation, consumption,

¹¹ Observers concur that tourism contributes to earnings in foreign exchange, to the gross domestic product (GDP), and to employment (Harrison 1992, 13). The cumulative effect of tourists' expenditures affects income, government revenue, employment, sales, output, and level of imports (Harrison 1992, 16). The contribution of tourism to any given economy is difficult to assess, however. For small island economies, such as Cuba and the Dominican Republic, there is considerable concern about the amount of money that is spent on imports—or leakage—to meet the demands of industry. For example, foreign commodities must be purchased to meet the demands and tastes of tourists. Economics that encourage linkages between tourism and domestic agriculture, for instance, can reduce their food imports and increase the multiplier effect (Freitag 1994). Without linkages to other parts of the economy, small island nations remain economically dependent on tourism and imports without realizing their maximum benefits (Martín de Holán and Phillips 1997).

¹² Jiménez 1999; Mesa-Lago and Pérez-López 1999; Wiarda 1999; World Bank 2001; Orozco 2002.

travel, migration, and marriage. Because of these opportunities, any liaison, sexual or not, is perceived as a potential boon for the local participant. Therefore, sex tourism is more than an illicit activity; it involves socially acceptable behaviors and values. It is a contingent and open-ended activity whose blurred boundaries are intertwined with elements of romance, leisure, consumption, travel, and marriage. While many of the participants in the sexual economy trade sexual services for cash, many others do not.¹³

Patterns of flexible labor with decentralized networks of production and distribution are common within tourist economies (Poon 1990; Mullings 1999). Those who do not have formal employment in tourist enterprises hustle at various activities connected to tourists. In Cuba, these hustlers are known as *jineteros* and *jineteras*. A *jinete*, according to the *Oxford Spanish Dictionary*, is a horseman or horsewoman, and *jinetea* is to ride and to break a horse.¹⁴ In Cuba, *jineterismo* is a colloquial term that refers to the broad range of activities and behaviors associated with hustling, including, but not limited to, sex for cash. *Jineteros* trade in the margins of the tourist economy; they are often seen in the streets of Havana, peddling everything from cigars and rum to sexual services. They act as tourists' guides, escorts, brokers of sexual services, and romantic companions.

Jinetero is not applied equally to all actors and behaviors in the informal economy because racist assumptions underpin the construction of *jineterismo*. Black Cubans are principally perceived as *jineteros* and *jineteras*, while light-skinned Cubans remain invisible and undistinguished in the world of *jineterismo* (Fernández 1999).

Jineterismo is also a gendered term and is applied to both men and women, with *jineteras* perceived as providing primarily commodified sexual services and companionship to foreigners. When applied to women, the term *jinetera* conjures images of a woman riding the tourist, alluding to the sexual and power relationship of a woman on top and in charge

¹³ Feminist historians of prostitution have established that sexual mercantile exchanges characterized the lives of young women at various historical junctures. Bartering, "treating," and other masked forms of trading sex for economic goods and other privileges are represented in the literature. See Rosen 1982; Stansell 1986; and Meyerowitz 1990. I wish to thank an anonymous reviewer, Nancy A. Hewitt, and Katrina Paxton for drawing my attention to this work.

¹⁴ The *Oxford Spanish Dictionary*, 3d ed., lists *jinetera* as a colloquial term that refers to a hooker or prostitute. No such reference appears for *jinetero*.

(Fernández 1999).¹⁵ The term *jinetera* emerged in the early 1990s with the sudden growth and expansion of international mass tourism after the collapse of the socialist trading bloc. Initially, little stigma was attached to the identity. Even Fidel Castro said that *jinetteras* did it for pleasure and not for money. This new term signified a distance from the stigma associated with prostitution but also distinguished itself from the commercial practices of prostitution known in Cuba prior to the revolution.¹⁶

Another sexual identity to emerge with the Cuban tourist economy in the 1990s is *pinguero*, derived from *pinga*, a slang term for penis, which is used to categorize men who provide commodified sexual practices within the tourist sector.¹⁷ While some *pingueros* identify themselves as straight, they tend to provide sexual services mainly to gay tourists because male-to-male sexual practices are more lucrative than straight sex. G. Derrick Hodge, writing about the growth of male sex work in Havana, maintains that many male-to-male interactions still abide by a “socialist relational ethic” or relational tendencies that are not based on material interest. The majority of sex workers he interviewed refused even to discuss money with tourists, accepting whatever they received as a “gift.” Hodge notes, “Money or, especially, clothing are accepted from tourists, but this exchange is constructed as ‘help’ from a ‘friend,’ not as payment from a trick” (2001, 22).¹⁸ He cautions, however, that socialist ethics are threat-

¹⁵ Many Cubans speculate as to the allegorical and historical references that this term suggests. *Jinetes* were the soldiers on horseback who fought against the Spaniards during the War of Independence. Since Spain was one of the principal tourist-sending countries in the early 1990s, the persons chasing after Spanish tourists became *jineteros* and *jineteras*.

¹⁶ Cuba was a major tourist destination for U.S. travelers from the 1920s to the late 1950s, billed as a pleasure-oriented playland with a vibrant nightlife of music, dancing, restaurants, world-famous nightclubs, shows, and Mafia-controlled gambling casinos. Cuba's tourism industry practically ceased to exist with the ascent of the revolutionary government. In the early 1960s the United States ended diplomatic and trade relations with Cuba and forbade U.S. citizens from traveling there (Schwartz 1997, 203). Rosalie Schwartz attests that sex work in Cuba today has little in common with the prerevolutionary era of “institutionalized sex shows and brothels” when Havana had more than 10,000 prostitutes (Schwartz 1997, 122). Rosa del Olmo (1979, 36) indicates that by 1961 there were 150,000 prostitutes and 3,000 pimps in Havana.

¹⁷ Appending the suffix *ero* to *pinga* creates the designation *pinguero* to describe someone whose essential quality, as in activity or profession, has to do with his *pinga*, or male erotic organ.

¹⁸ Cuba's entrance into the global market economy has altered and radically changed social relations, or what Hodge calls the socialist relational ethic (2001). This assertion runs the risk, however, of construing a pristine socialist past where social relations were free of commercial and personal interests. It is important to note the presence, prior to the economic crisis of the 1990s, of what Cubans term *socio-lismo*, or cronyism. According to Cuban

ened by the influx of tourist dollars and foreign investments and by the invasion of market relations in sex work (22). In fact, some young *pingueros* admitted that being a *pinguero* is a business, “a business in which I get what I need to dress, eat, help my family, and enjoy myself. I don’t do it because I like it, I do it just for the money” (Hodge 2001, 22).¹⁹

In the Dominican Republic, men who work in the informal economy of the tourist sector are known as *sanky pankys* (a word play on hanky panky). *Sanky pankys*, or beach boys, are gigolos who cater exclusively to foreign tourists, providing sexual services and companionship to both men and women, straight and gay. *Sanky pankys* originally appeared on the tourist scene during the late 1970s when organized gay tours were widespread in the area (De Moya et al. 1992). Today they work primarily with white, middle-aged foreign women who seek romance and adventure with young, fit, and dreadlocked black men (De Moya et al. 1992; Herold, García, and De Moya 2001; Sánchez Taylor 2001).

The more successful beach boys tend to be friendly and nonthreatening in their pursuit of female tourists, using heavy doses of flattery in an overall seduction plan that involves a wide array of social activities and experiences such as sightseeing, dining, and dancing (Herold, García, and De Moya 2001). Furthermore, the more professional gigolos do not consider it appropriate to exploit women by engaging in one-night stands (Herold, García, and De Moya 2001). It is more productive to cultivate a relationship that could provide other substantial rewards such as the possibility of a long-lasting romance that brings return visits and perhaps even marriage and migration.²⁰

As in Cuba, there is an extensive marketplace of young women in the Dominican Republic, widely publicized on the Internet and in adult videos. The typical woman working with tourists is a young, single mother who provides for her children, mother, and younger siblings. Yolanda, a

sexologist Denys Figueroa, this amounts to the use of relationships and friendships for convenience to resolve life’s daily necessities. This is done at the margins of formal structures, such as government institutions, as well as within structures of affect, such as family and neighborhood networks (personal communication with author, 2002).

¹⁹ The research by Gisela Fosado (in press) confirms these findings as well.

²⁰ Herold, García, and De Moya (2001) indicate that not all female tourists provide money at the end of their visit. In some cases, the men only receive free meals and drinks. Generally, the men reported receiving from between \$100 to \$500 from each woman, although some received more. Some of the women also bought gifts such as motorcycles or expensive clothes. *Sanky pankys* are very successful financially and earn substantially more than the typical male in the Dominican Republic. For example, some reported earning about \$1,000 a month or more. In comparison, the average wage for a worker in the Dominican Republic is \$60 a month.

twenty-one-year-old mother of three from Puerto Plata, represents the predicament of some of the young women involved with foreigners. The day I interviewed Yolanda, she had just returned from Santo Domingo, where she arranged a tourist visa for a trip to Austria to visit her boyfriend in Vienna.

At age twenty Yolanda found herself with three children and no financial support. Her husband had left her, renouncing all responsibility for the children. Her uncle, who worked at one of the many tourist enclaves in the area, helped her to get a job as an "entertainer" at the resort. This work entailed facilitating recreational activities such as volleyball games, pool games, and conga dances for the resort's guests and paid meager wages that did not support her family. The constant sexual harassment from male tourists was also infuriating. They would touch, grab, and ask her to go back to their rooms or to go out dancing. This position, nevertheless, allowed her to meet some of her boyfriends.

Her first long-term relationship was with a twenty-eight-year-old German tourist who invited her to go out after work. She agreed and thereafter saw him every night of his vacation. They dined in lavish restaurants and shopped at expensive boutiques. They spent a weekend at a tourist beach up the coast. When his vacation ended, he promised that she could visit him in Germany, and he left her *un regalito* (a small gift) of \$300. She visited him in Germany a few months later but eventually ended the arrangement because she felt that he was unwilling to commit to a more permanent relationship.

Her latest boyfriend was a thirty-three-year-old Austrian engineer from Vienna, whom she also met at the resort complex. They went out during his vacation and became romantically involved. Before leaving the country, he had a telephone installed at her house so that he could call her regularly, and he asked her to quit her job at the resort. He sent her a monthly remittance that paid her rent and helped to support her children. Yolanda's experience, and that of many *sanky pankys*, *pingueros*, *jineteros*, and *jineteras*, indicates that the elements involved in what is termed *sex tourism* can be ambiguous and go beyond totalizing frameworks of victims and oppressors or of purely commercial exchanges for sex. An emotional economy is at work that problematizes simple assumptions.

The labor of romance

In a tourist setting, it is difficult to discern who is a prostitute and what counts as prostitution. Instead of operating in socialized and institutionalized spaces of sex work, as found in Southeast Asia or Western Europe

and the United States, where forms of contract or indentured labor operate, the new patterns of sexual commerce in Cuba and the Dominican Republic are opportunistic, fluid, and ambiguous. They are in contrast to the brothels that cater to a domestic clientele in the Dominican Republic and were prevalent in Cuba in the 1950s. A sexual economy operates within the heavily guarded resort compounds—with hospitality workers providing sexual services—or in the streets where young men and women approach and attract foreigners. The transactions that take place are difficult to recognize and categorize as a form of labor; instead, the landscape of tourism lends itself more to interpretations of adventure and romance.

As with most of the Caribbean, mass tourism in Cuba and the Dominican Republic has moved to the all-inclusive model of resort development. In the all-inclusive resort, a tourist's expenses, including airplane travel, accommodations, meals, transfers, entertainment, recreation, drinks, and, most important, tips, are paid for in the country of destination, usually with a credit card. Typified by the French conglomerate Club Med, which opened in Cuba in 1996, most of the hotel resorts in the Caribbean have now adopted some form of the all-inclusive model. These enclaves strive to cater to all the tourists' needs, keeping the tourists virtually locked into the confined space of the resort and segregated from the local population. Tourists are made to wear color-coded plastic bracelets that allow "uniformed security personnel to better control their movements" (Stanley 2000, 68).

The change to the all-inclusive model of tourism has had devastating effects for workers who depend on the tourism economy and for the neighboring areas. Many of the hospitality workers who in the past counted on gratuities to complement their meager wages and to earn foreign exchange are now pushed into the sex sector to replace lost earnings. For example, most hotel workers participate in the sex trade by allowing tourists to take their "dates" back to their rooms or by facilitating sexual liaisons between tourists and locals. Along with room service and extra towels, many hospitality workers also provide sexual services to their guests. Maira, a chambermaid in Varadero, Cuba's premier beach resort, recounts her initiation into providing sexual services with a Spanish tourist: "I fell in his good graces. He would always be looking at me. He always left me a gift. As he said, he was buying me. He was always looking at me, my movements, my gestures, my way of being, and things like that, until one day he approached me 'about having sexual relations.'" This marked the beginning of Maira's extra-docket activities at the hotel. Carefully and discreetly, she was able to earn extra cash and has received two marriage proposals from hotel guests.

The transition into the sexual economy can be smooth for hospitality workers due to a number of factors. First, sex and romance, whether offered by the host or requested by the guest, are part of an organizational dynamic structured by the industry. Second, hospitality workers, educated to please their guests, must contend with a clientele's high expectation of servility. Workers are trained to comply enthusiastically with constant demands and repeated requests from guests. Third, the highly militarized compounds, with round-the-clock security detail, effectively keep the local population out and guests in. Fourth, the constant police aggravation and incarceration of women in the neighboring areas make the hotel workers easy targets for sexual propositions and harassment. Hotel guests turn to the resort workers, who are often more than eager to procure extra earnings while on the job. Therefore, sex tourism operates within the tourist enclaves to subsidize the low wages of the formal sector workers and to redistribute the wealth of tourists more directly to hospitality workers. A tourism worker in Varadero sums up this new contingency: "*Camareras* [chambermaids] are the legitimate and official *jineteras*."

From tourism advertising and marketing to the organizational structure of the workforce, travel for pleasure and leisure to third-world countries is exceedingly dependent on gendered and racialized sexual constructions. Most hotel workers in Varadero are trained at the local tourism-training center, the José Smith Comas Institute of Hotel and Tourism Services. The school has strict regulations when it comes to physical appearance, with weight, age, and height requirements. Trainees must be young, attractive, and in good physical shape. Not only are youth and aesthetics premium considerations, but so is race. The training and distribution of work are organized according to racial, sexual, and gender considerations, resulting in occupational segregation. While most of the front desk workers are lighter-skinned Cubans, entertainment workers and back-kitchen help are mainly black. Entertainment workers, also known as *animadores* (animators), are young, scantily clad, dark-skinned young men and women who instruct the guests in dancing, games, and other forms of recreation. Their work is mainly physical and sensual and often involves suggestive and sexualized contact with guests. Black performers are also predominantly employed in hotels that feature live shows. The organization of work is, therefore, a circuitous interplay of international tourism's rigidly formalistic prescription of inclusion and exclusion of workers based on racial and sexual occupational categories. The racial and sexual ordering reflects the consequences and legacy of colonialism as they play out on this current stage of global capitalism. Writing about the representation of the *mulata* body in Cuban touristic culture, cultural critic Alicia Arrizón

aply states that the racialized performativity encompasses “all the complexities and unstable processes about how race, gender, and sexuality enact the power relations within colonial, neocolonial, and postcolonial discourses” (Arrizón 2002, 137).

Studies conducted in the Dominican Republic also reveal the prevalence of sexual relations between hotel workers and tourists, with workers in food and beverage services, maintenance, administration, entertainment, and reception providing sex to tourists. One study reports that close to 20 percent of resort workers admitted to having had sexual relations with tourists (CEPROSH 1997). Another study confirms that 38 percent of male sex workers had regular jobs in hotels as waiters, porters, security guards, and so forth (CESDEM 1996). This is further confirmed by a recent study of *sanky pankys* who regularly worked as tour guides, waiters, or bartenders, or who rented out beach and sports equipment (Herold, García, and De Moya 2001). Direct contact with tourists is, therefore, a factor that fosters tourist-oriented sex work.

Many of the young men and women hope that their liaisons with foreigners will lead to marriage and migration. Studies confirm that most *pingueros*, *jineteros/-as*, and *sanky pankys* prefer to accept gifts of clothing, jewelry, and meals from tourists rather than to negotiate money for sex, because direct commercial transactions foreclose other possibilities and because direct commercial transactions confirm an identity as prostitute that they do not desire. Self-identified *sanky pankys* in the Dominican Republic, for example, reveal that they never ask for payment directly. Some *sanky pankys* may even offer to pay for drinks or admissions to the disco. They use covert strategies to procure financial gain. For instance, after establishing a more intimate connection with a tourist, they talk about being poor or having a sick relative or wanting to continue their education or start a small business and about their inability to do so because of their poverty (Herold, García, and De Moya 2001). They often maintain and continue to cultivate the romantic relationship after the tourist leaves the island. Letters, telephone calls, faxes, and return visits keep the fire burning. A few receive money and plane tickets for travel to Europe or Canada. All of the beach boys in the Herold, García, and De Moya (2001) study had one or more friends who had migrated to other countries with the help of their tourist lovers. This is confirmed in both locations of this study.

The Herold, García, and De Moya (2001) study also indicates that many of the beach boy–tourist relationships are focused on companionship and that neither love nor sex enters the picture. This represents another commonality with the case of Cuba, where some prefer to relate to tourists

on the basis of affection, intimacy, or friendship as opposed to sexual behavior. In both places, there is a general tendency to back away from overtly commodifying sexual relations by carefully navigating the borders of love and money. As a twenty-one-year-old native of Havana explained, "It's better to act as if this is your first time and not to discuss the money. That way they'll think that you are not doing it just for the money, that you really love them." It is a preferable strategy to distance oneself from commercial sexual exchanges in order to procure more stable and lucrative social roles, such as that of a girlfriend or wife.

Unlike the women whom Herold, García, and De Moya (2001) interviewed in the Puerto Plata region of the Dominican Republic, the women whom I interviewed referred to their tourist acquaintances as *amigos*, or friends, indicating an unwillingness to characterize them as customers or paying clients.²¹ Through this reluctance to characterize the relationships as strictly commercial endeavors, they can expand and create multiple possibilities for their relationships. With gifts seen as expressions of love and not as payment for services rendered, men and women hope to obscure the dichotomy between love and money. Emotional labor is used to break down the boundaries of commercial exchanges or at least to blur the lines between intimacy and labor and to preserve the dignity of the local participant. This liminal space is marked by fluidity, ambiguity, and heterogeneity and provides opportunities that direct commercial transactions cannot.²²

Beyond sex and romance

Notwithstanding all this flexibility in social and economic arrangements, some individuals get marked and stigmatized as sex workers. Who meets the criteria? What counts as sex work under these circumstances? The social location and characteristics of the participants often determine what

²¹ Herold, García, and De Moya (2001) interviewed fourteen women, but the main focus of their interviews was *sanky pankys*, with whom they developed more detailed interviews. The women they interviewed suggested sex for a specific fee shortly after meeting the tourist. Yet the male tourists they interviewed who were approached in this very explicit manner found it a disgusting rather than an appealing style. Few of the women whom I interviewed reported this approach. They preferred the open-ended approach in their encounters.

²² The liminality of tourist-related relationships has been captured in cultural productions from the United States, Spain, and Cuba. See, e.g., Jordi Sierra i Fabra's 1997 *Cuba: La noche de la jinetera*, Pico Iyer's 1995 novel *Cuba and the Night*, and Carlos Marcovich's 1998 Cuban/Mexican film *¿Quién diablos es Juliette?* In these works, the relationships between foreign men and Cuban women are ambiguous and fraught with contradictions.

counts as sex work more than any particular type of behavior. I maintain that race, class, and gender create and delimit the playing field.

For example, a *mulata* from Santiago living in Havana, seen in the company of foreigners, is automatically categorized as a sex worker.²³ But a pale-skinned university student, who only dates foreigners and eventually marries a Frenchman, is not considered a sex worker. A graduate student from California, walking the streets of Havana with a black Cuban man, is readily perceived as a sex tourist. An office worker in the Dominican Republic who drives her car every night after work to a hotel casino with the intent of attracting a foreign boyfriend is not considered a sex worker. However, a Dominican woman with dark skin, exiting a disco alone in a tourist area, runs the risk of being incarcerated as part of a mass arrest of prostitutes.

Anthropologist Nadine Fernández's research illuminates important insights regarding the issue of *jineterismo* and race. In an article on women, race, and tourism in Cuba, she explores how constructions of race and class are linked to *jineterismo* in sexual encounters (Fernández 1999). Two of her informants—white, young women from well-positioned families with access to tourist enclaves—were able to circumvent the stigma of being perceived as *jineteras*. One of them, Doricel, met a Mexican tourist with whom she spent time during his stay, engaging in social activities and visiting tourist resorts. Even though this was a short-term association with an uncertain future, where sex and material goods were exchanged, it was not perceived as tourist-oriented prostitution. Rather, family and friends construed this relationship as one of romance and attached their hopes to his return and their possible marriage. Her light skin, cultural capital, and socioeconomic class exempted her from being classified as a sex worker.

"Prostitute," or "sex worker," is an identity assigned in specific situations, contingent on the social location and perceived characteristics of the participants, and lacking ambiguity in performance. In most situations, the permeable boundaries between leisure and labor, paid work and unpaid work, and private and public are difficult to discern, thus making it possible to resist the category of "worker." The category of "sex worker," there-

²³ Santiago is at the eastern end of the island. Historically, it has been an underdeveloped region plagued by poverty and unemployment. It is also composed predominantly of Afro-Cubans, many of whom are descendants of earlier migrations from Jamaica and Haiti. They are known in the Havana vernacular as *palestinos*, or Palestinians. In April 1997 the government passed a law against internal migration due to the increased number of people entering Havana in search of better economic conditions (LaFranchi 1997). Many *palestinos* are also *pingueros* (see Fosado in press).

fore, comes with its own disciplinary functions and tends to signify the participation of a subordinate racial, gender, and class "other."

Furthermore, the notion of "sex worker" presents an either/or view of relationships and sexual practices. It creates a dichotomy between commercial transactions devoid of affectional attributes and vilified as racial fetishism as compared to normative relations lacking material gain and racial desire. Put another way, desire and affection are defined as "lighter" and prostitution as "darker," effectively racializing the entire process. This binary opposition presumes relations not tainted by economic dependence, speculation, motivation, and interest, which apparently take place between individuals of the same racial, national, and class background. To separate sex work and sex tourism from the homosexual and heterosexual relationships that take place in tourist-sending societies is to create artificial boundaries between human relationships that cannot pass close scrutiny. To locate sex tourism and sex work as something that happens "over there" is to avoid "the challenges and insights" into our society that a deeper examination can provide (Ryan 2000, 36).

The concept of sex work is also difficult to apply to the new forms of flexible labor and to same-sex desire within tourist economies. Consequently, I make a case against portraying all practices and social relations within tourist economies as sex work and subsuming significantly different forms of sexuality under the category of "sex worker." The stable identity of "sex worker" presupposes that there is a fixed identity and thereby creates and freezes differences and subjects. This identity may be fixed where institutions like brothels or pimps control the conditions of women's sexual activity but not in these less immediately constrained situations.

Although *sex worker* is the prevalent term applied to participants in sex tourism in the Caribbean, I argue that the prevalent sociolabor realities underscore the need for a more complex analytical framework that accounts for fluid arrangements and complex relationships that do not easily lend themselves to collective identification and action. As Deborah Pruitt and Suzanne LaFont (1995, 423) find with Rent-A-Dreads in Jamaica, while the relationship may appear as one of prostitute (the Jamaican man) and client (the Euro-American woman) to outsiders, both partners in the relationship perceive it as courtship.²⁴ In other words, in tourism and romance, the meanings that people attribute to actions cannot be specified in advance. *Sex worker* is an empowering term only in situations where

²⁴ *Rent-A-Dreads* is a term frequently used in Jamaica to refer to men who wear dreadlocks and provide sexual services and companionship to female tourists. See Pruitt and LaFont 1995 and Phillips 1999.

the woman or man does not have substantial control over the disposition of sexual activities because the term marks those activities as labor and therefore as entailing worker rights. There is no justification for imposing the term *sex worker* on people who do not identify as such. In fact, within this context, the term *sex worker* imposes an arbitrarily derogatory and racist label. If we leave open other possibilities, we can just as easily understand sex work within the typically gendered, raced, and classed disciplines of romance. I propose that we closely examine sex tourism not as an either/or proposition but as a landscape for a multiplicity and range of gradations of erotic, affectional, and even spiritual practices and as a landscape with some institutions and practices that mark sexual activities as work or labor.

Gayle Rubin contends that while “good’ sex acts are imbued with emotional complexity and reciprocity, sex acts ‘on the bad side’ of the line are considered utterly repulsive and devoid of all emotional nuance” (Hubbard 1999, 44). I suggest that we need to examine our notions about the separation of love, romance, and money. The refusal to commodify all sexual relations with foreigners, the insistence on procuring gifts instead of cash payments, and the creation of flexible identities for themselves and their tourist *amigos* challenge our notions of love devoid of economic interests and of work devoid of sexuality.

Legal and enforcement issues relating to sex tourism

The elusiveness that exists in the practices and perception of tourism and sex in Cuba and the Dominican Republic is mirrored in the juridical context. In both countries, prostitution operates in a gray area of the law. No laws precisely prohibit a person from selling his or her sexual services. The laws that speak most directly to prostitution deal with the practices of intermediaries—those who profit from prostitution.²⁵ But through the mass arrests of unaccompanied women, especially women with darker skin, the state—both in Cuba and the Dominican Republic—regulates the circulation of women in tourist zones.

²⁵ Within the Dominican juridical framework, the laws that address prostitution include Articles 334, 334-1, and 335 of the penal code (*Contra la violencia intrafamiliar*, Ley No. 24-97; Señor 1989). Articles 334 and 334-1 were modified in 1997, making them extra-territorial laws. These articles seek to punish those who benefit from the earnings of sex workers and who facilitate the practice of prostitution. Although the intent was to prosecute international trafficking, the laws also penalize the families of sex workers who live off prostitution and the female relatives and friends who commonly facilitate sex workers’ entry into the sex trade (Cabezas 1999).

In the Dominican Republic, law enforcement uses mass arrest to keep locals—frequently working-class, dark-skinned women—from bothering tourists, because their dress, demeanor, and participatory claim to public spaces construct them as “dangerous” women of suspect morality.²⁶ In contrast, the law does not target women in more privileged positions—generally university students and office workers—who participate in the sex trade through more sanctioned and concealed arrangements that approximate heterosexual romance.

Mari, a twenty-three-year-old woman born in the capital city of Santo Domingo, works with tourists to support her two sons and her mother and to pay for her sister’s university education. Asked about the incidence of police violence, she offered: “They take you and don’t give you a reason why. They say it’s for bothering tourists. When you exit the disco, they come and grab you. Many times, they have hit me. Once they slapped me and gave me a black eye because I told them that there was no justice here. There was justice when it was convenient for them.” Carmen, a forty-year-old former sex worker who was very angry about police ill treatment of women, said:

When women here are arrested, they are thrown in the buses like pigs. You understand? Tourists don’t like to see that. Right now, there’s a lot of problems because they don’t let women into the discotheques, except the ones that they want. So one goes to the discotheque and gets mistreated, and they send you to jail for five days.

²⁶ Elizabeth Bernstein’s (2001) superb study of sexual commerce provides an analysis of the segmentation, stratification, and hierarchical organization of the sex industry in San Francisco and four western European cities. She documents recent changes in the restructuring of the economy in postindustrial cities and in kinship patterns that have “spawned a new set of erotic dispositions, ones which the market is well-poised to satisfy” (Bernstein 2001, 202). Bernstein’s study details the ways in which new forms of sexual labor, made possible in part by technological innovations, have produced niche markets where white, middle-class, college-educated women can ply their trade indoors in relative anonymity and beyond the intervention of the state’s agents and regulatory apparatus. As with hospitality workers in the Caribbean, class, race, and cultural capital make it possible to circumvent disciplining practices. In contrast, public forms of sexual commerce, exemplified by street-walkers in San Francisco, are subject to surveillance, constant police harassment, criminalization, and punitive measures. This sexual economy is characterized by women who are marked by race or ethnicity, class, or citizenship; women of color in the United States; and third-world immigrant women in Europe, who are vulnerable to police harassment and arrests, as well as rape, murder, extortion, and robbery. This highly segmented market, what Bernstein terms an *industrial form of prostitution*, is similar to the street levels of prostitution found in Cuba and the Dominican Republic.

ALC: Do you ask why they arrest you?

They just tell you "you're arrested." They put you in jail with prisoners who have been arrested for killing or for selling drugs. That's who they put you in there with! If you say anything to re-criminate them, they hit you.

Women are verbally abused, beaten, robbed, and sometimes raped by the police.²⁷ Arrested in order to control the number of women in the streets and to generate income for the state, as well as bribes and sexual favors for the police, they are incarcerated until they can pay a hefty fine. Consequently, this intersection of law and gender is a highly productive space for capital accumulation and the enforcement of gender and sexual norms. Thus, a Dominican woman, when asked if she had ever been arrested, succinctly answered: "Yes, many times, for nothing, for being a Dominican, for being in the streets of town."

The same is true in Cuba. In Havana, I spoke with a young *mulata* who was incarcerated in June 2001. She attributed her arrest to the way she was dressed, with white spandex pants and high heels, and to the fact that she was walking alone late at night. She recalled going home from a party at around midnight when some Spanish tourists called out to her. The police were watching nearby. When the tourists walked away, she was arrested for "harassing foreigners" and taken to prison. For the next three days, she was subjected to police interrogations, a gynecological exam, blood tests for sexually transmitted diseases, and psychological counseling. She was given a *carta de advertencia*, or a letter of warning; with three such arrests and a *carta de advertencia*, she could be incarcerated in a rehabilitation center for up to four years.

As part of its efforts to intervene and mediate the negative impact of tourism in Cuban society and culture, beginning in 1998 Cuba implemented a system to criminalize and rehabilitate women of questionable morality—in other words, dissident sexual citizens. Rehabilitation centers were established with the assistance of the Federation of Cuban Women, or Federación de Mujeres Cubanas (FMC), Cuba's premier women's organization. Judicial authorities can institutionalize so-called dangerous women in rehabilitation camps for up to four years. Since prostitution is

²⁷ In the two countries, I interviewed women who had been sexually abused by the police. A Dominican woman was raped by a police officer. At the time of the interview, she had a six-year-old daughter as a result of that rape. In Varadero, a woman was propositioned by a police officer in exchange for impunity. He not only demanded sexual favors but also stole her jewelry and money. Women in both countries often spoke of police officers extorting sexual favors in exchange for clemency.

not illegal, the state uses a law defined as “state of dangerousness” to incarcerate women.²⁸ This law speaks to the tendency of a person to commit crimes that are observed to be in contradiction of the norms of socialist morality.

The length of stay at the rehabilitation centers depends on the degree of risk to society that the women represent and their likelihood of rehabilitation.²⁹ Once a woman is incarcerated, she must prove through her attitude and behavior that she has been rehabilitated. The United Nations special rapporteur on violence against women, the first UN human rights official to be invited by the Cuban government to visit the island, questions the arbitrariness of leaving a sentence open until officials determine that the person no longer poses a social threat (United Nations Economic and Social Council 2000). She emphasizes that this leaves room for abuse and subjectivity and is inconsistent with fair judicial procedure.

While the UN report is critical of the rehabilitation camps in Cuba, no women’s or human rights organizations have denounced such policies. Not even the right-wing Cuban American community in Miami has stepped forward to denounce these practices. Ferocious in reporting any alleged human rights violation in Cuba, they have remained silent on this topic.

In a twenty-six-page report, UN special rapporteur Radhika Coomaraswamy documents her visits to several of the rehabilitation centers throughout the island, where women receive training in socially acceptable and gender-defined careers. They work from six to eight hours a day,

²⁸ Women charged with a “state of dangerousness” are sentenced under Article 72 of the penal code, which states: “A dangerous state is considered the special proclivity in which a person is found to commit crimes shown by their conduct in observed contradiction manifested with the norms of the socialist morality” (*Código Penal* 1998).

²⁹ Cuba has a history of incarcerating sexual dissidents in rehabilitation camps. In 1965 the state established military units to aid production (*unidades militares de ayuda a la producción*), which were camps in which homosexuals and political dissidents were forced to work in agricultural labor. There is no evidence that the camps were set up with the sole aim of incarcerating only homosexuals, but some observers claim that as many as 60,000 homosexuals were forced into the camps. Conscientious objectors to military service, Jehovah’s Witnesses, and Seventh-day Adventists were also jailed (Lumsden 1996). Less punitive were the campaigns to rehabilitate prostitutes and pimps after the triumph of the Cuban Revolution, in which 3,000 pimps were apprehended and sent to cut sugarcane. The revolutionary leader Ernesto “Che” Guevara determined that the best way to rehabilitate the women was to set up a large textile factory where they could work in three shifts. Additionally, Cuba’s famed Hotel Nacional served as a base for training prostitutes as seamstresses. According to del Olmo (1979), most were rehabilitated in one to two years. Nevertheless, del Olmo and other social observers indicate that women continued to trade their bodies for goods—e.g., a pair of blue jeans—long after the rehabilitation campaigns were gone (del Olmo 1979; Fusco 1996).

mostly in the agricultural sector. Every fifteen days they are allowed a two-hour visit from family and friends, but they are not allowed to move freely outside the facility.

The use of rehabilitation centers in Cuba has had mixed success. Women such as Karina, a black woman from the central provinces who was arrested for being with tourists in Varadero, was not rehabilitated during her incarceration in a labor camp. She talked of her experience and determination to continue as a *jinettera*:

I am single, with two kids, and I went to Varadero to look for a tourist. I have no shame whatsoever in saying this because it's my body and because my mother died and I was left to care for my two brothers and I had no one to help me. I left the kids with a neighbor and went to Varadero. In Varadero I was with a tourist who paid me very well, a Spanish man who paid me one hundred dollars, and after that the police caught me. I was sentenced to a year but released after six months due to my good conduct. I was there for being with a tourist, but I don't understand it because, after all, it's my body and one can do with it what one pleases. I spent six months picking fruit, and they paid me, but very little.

Karina had no intentions of quitting her work as a *jinettera*. As she related her story, she explained that being with Cuban men does not pay and that she needs to support her two boys and two brothers and is "not about to give it up for free."

Sexual citizenship and human rights

The clash between unsanctioned sexualities and heteronormativity is perceived as a threat, "as dangerous," to the cohesion and commonality of the nation. As Philip Hubbard contends, "the idea that the state *requires* these periodic moral panics to reassert its right to power . . . supports the view that questions of sexual morality are prominent in definitions of citizenship" (Hubbard 2001, 53).

The moral panic in Cuba and the Dominican Republic targets unaccompanied women in public spaces, although *palestinos*, *sanky pankys*, *pingueros*, *jineteros*, lesbians, and other sexual minorities are also harassed by the police, subject to police sweeps, and at times incarcerated for minor violations. However, they are not targeted for rehabilitation programs. Underpinning this gender distinction is the fact that, in the Dominican Republic and Cuba, women who have sex outside of monogamous, pro-

creative relationships are often condemned as bad sexual subjects, while male promiscuity is widely tolerated, or even celebrated, as the natural outcome of male sexual urges.

As early as 1995 the FMC blamed prostitution on women whom it described as greedy, vain, and lacking morality, social values, emotional maturity, and ultimately revolutionary consciousness (Díaz, Fernández, and Caram 1996; Peraza Hebra, Villanueva Samon, and Bazán Pino 1997). In an interview, an FMC spokesperson, Celia Berges Díaz, denied the link between tourism and prostitution, saying "tourism is not to blame." Instead she blamed the poor values of the women themselves (Benjamin 1998). At a conference on prostitution and tourism in Cárdenas, Cuba, in 1997, members of the FMC announced that it was very difficult to rehabilitate *jineteras*. One of the members from the Havana delegation expressed the opinion that the best method of rehabilitation would be to involve "these women" in monogamous relationships with Cuban men, or *relaciones de pareja con hombres cubanos*. However, several of these young women told me that one of the attractions of tourist men is precisely that they are *not* Cuban men.

In January 1999, Fidel Castro proclaimed, "A pair of high heels, a luxurious little shoe, a seductive perfume, a new dress cannot be the price of honor and the sustenance of a nation" (quoted in Paternostro 2000, 18). Cuban women are seen to represent the incursion of capitalism, defilement of nationalist pride, and erosion of patriarchal domain. In contrast, male sex workers are perceived as a powerful extension of Cuban national identity, vanquishing the foreign intruder. Hodge claims that there is less political and cultural condemnation of male sex workers because "no autonomy has been lost, and symbolically at least no Cuban body has been defiled" (2001, 23). So while male sex workers are perceived as national heroes, their female counterparts are considered deviants and a detriment to society. As Hodge so aptly declares, "*Pingueros* attract sex-tourism dollars to the state hotels and airline, and they multiply tourists' discretionary dollars by spending them in state stores—all the while, symbolically conquering the bodies of the foreign invaders, like any good revolutionary Cuban man" (2001, 23). The state's moral condemnation and exclusion of outlaw sexual practices indicate the complex way in which heterosexuality and patriarchy intertwine to create partial citizens (Hubbard 2001).

The crux of the matter is that women's sexual rights have not been established within national and international legal instruments even though sexual rights discourse has been on the international women's organizing

agenda for several decades (Bunch and Fried 1996).³⁰ In both feminism and human rights discourse, female sexuality is worthy of representation and protection when it is embedded in the depiction of an injured and violated female subjectivity, a depiction dependent on representations of passive female sexuality that conforms to heterosexual norms (LeMoncheck 1997). The concept of female sexual agency remains absent from the conceptualizations of human rights instruments and laws.³¹ Yet the idea of sexual rights is a useful notion for building alliances with other sexual minorities and can provide a platform that allows us to move beyond reductive categories and frameworks. Sexual rights prove concretely more useful in situations where labor rights may not be established. Without international recognition of basic rights to sexuality, religious doctrine and the legal-moral framework collude unhindered to condemn nonnormative heterosexual practices.

Sexual citizenship can point us toward the affirmation of women's diverse and complex sexualities, particularly those outside heteronormativity. Whether trading sexual services for marriage, money, pleasure, or other material and nonmaterial considerations, the right to one's body is "not an individualist, exclusionary interest but rather a fundamental condition for women's development and strength as a social group and thus for their full participation as citizens" (Petchesky 1995, 403). This is not to suggest sexual rights as a universal remedy for an international regime

³⁰ The concept of sexual rights recognizes the role of the state and other actors in controlling women's sexuality, without confining women's sexuality to issues of reproduction. It provides a framework that goes beyond reproductive rights to affirm a "positive" claim to broader bodily integrity and behavioral freedom, such as the right to sexual expression, desire, pleasure, and sexual and gender identity and orientation (Rothschild 2000).

³¹ As I've said elsewhere (Cabezas in press), the "International Conference on Population and Development, in Cairo 1994, advanced the concept of sexual rights, and the terms related to sex, such as sexual health and sexuality, were affirmed as productive possibilities." Rosalind Petchesky comments that for the first time in any international legal instrument sex appears as "something positive rather than violent, abusive, or sanctified and hidden within heterosexual marriage and childbearing" (2000, 84). At the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995, participants debated the language for women's sexual rights but ultimately rejected strong language (Bunch and Fried 1996, 202). The Platform for Action, which outlined the human rights of women in twelve critical areas, also rejected the rights of lesbians and excluded the term *sexual orientation* from the platform (Bunch and Fried 1996). Only in the health section did the platform state, "The human rights of women include their right to have control over and decide freely and responsibly on matters related to their sexuality, including sexual and reproductive health, free of coercion, discrimination, and violence" (Bunch and Fried 1996; UN Fourth World Conference on Women 1995, par. 96, as cited in Wallace 1997).

of Western hegemony and imperialism or the unfettered global expansion of capitalism. But as a concept and discourse, sexual rights can prove fruitful in challenging the regulatory mechanisms that are used to police and discipline all women, not just those who are sexual outlaws.

Conclusion

International mass tourism in the Caribbean has led to the erosion of boundaries between labor practices and romantic relationships. Greater economic informality makes it difficult to clearly define all of the new social and economic ventures as labor. Cubans and Dominicans challenge and shape their condition of subordination within the global economy by eroding and confusing the lines between love and money, romance and work. They navigate the interstices of the racialized, gendered, and sexualized structures imposed by the transnational tourism industry and the state. For them, this offers the possibility of escaping brutal poverty, whether through love, friendship, companionship, or sex with tourists.

The implementation of neoliberal reforms and pro-market forces combined with the exigencies of globalization are some of the factors driving the growth of sex tourism. A framework broader than the one currently used to examine sex tourism is needed, one that can account for the provisional practices and identities that constitute sexual markets and that can envelop notions of labor and sex as liminal. We need more complicated approaches that enhance our understanding of erotics and that place sexual citizenship at the core of the analysis of labor.

A recurring challenge to sex tourism researchers in the Caribbean, and one that has not been sufficiently addressed, is that tourists and locals do not self-identify as sex tourists or as sex workers. The stigma attached to prostitution could be partly responsible for the lack of identification. However, this is only a partial reading. Researchers must keep in mind that our evaluations need to have some connection to the way people understand themselves. We cannot employ categories to understand diverse cultures by ignoring how people make sense of their lives. The opportunity is ripe for researchers to analyze the adequacy of their categories and to listen more closely to informants.

*Department of Women's Studies
University of California, Riverside*

References

- Albuquerque, Klaus de. 1998. "Sex, Beach Boys, and Female Tourists in the Caribbean." *Sexuality and Culture* 2:87-111.
- Arrizón, Alicia. 2002. "Race-ing Performativity through Transculturation, Taste, and the Mulata Body." *Theatre Research International* 27(2):136-52.
- Atkins, G. Pope, and Larman Wilson. 1998. *The Dominican Republic and the United States: From Imperialism to Transnationalism*. Athens: University of Georgia Press.
- Barry, Tom, Beth Wood, and Deb Preusch. 1984. *The Other Side of Paradise: Foreign Control in the Caribbean*. New York: Grove.
- Benjamin, Medea. 1998. "Chasing the Good Life: Tourism Takes Off." *New Internationalist* 301 (May): 26-28.
- Bernstein, Elizabeth. 2001. "Economics of Desire: Sexual Commerce and Post-industrial Culture." Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, Berkeley.
- Brennan, Denise Ellen. 1998. "Everything Is for Sale Here: Sex Tourism in Sosúa, the Dominican Republic." Ph.D. dissertation, Yale University.
- Bunch, Charlotte, and Susana Fried. 1996. "Beijing '95: Moving Women's Human Rights from Margin to Center." *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 22(1):200-204.
- Cabezas, Amalia Lucía. 1998. "Pleasure and Its Pain: Sex Tourism in Sosúa, the Dominican Republic." Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, Berkeley.
- . 1999. "Women's Work Is Never Done: Sex Tourism in Sosúa, the Dominican Republic." In Kempadoo 1999, 93-123.
- . In press. "Accidental Crossings: Tourism, Sex Work, and Women's Rights in the Dominican Republic." In *On the Edges of Feminism: Transcultural Engagements*, ed. Marguerite R. Waller and Sylvia Marcos. New York: St. Martin's/Palgrave.
- CEPROSH (Centro de Promoción y Solidaridad Humana). 1997. *Proyecto hotelero*. Puerto Plata, Dominican Republic: CEPROSH.
- CESDEM (Centro de Estudios Sociales y Demográficos). 1996. "Encuesta sobre conocimientos, creencias, actitudes, y prácticas acerca del SIDA/ETS en trabajadoras sexuales y hombres involucrados en la industria del sexo en las localidades de Puerto Plata, Sosúa, y Monte Llano." Photocopy, COVICOSIDA, Puerto Plata, Dominican Republic.
- Davidson, Julia O'Connell. 1996. "Sex Tourism in Cuba." *Race and Class* 38(1): 39-48.
- De Moya, E. Antonio, Rafael García, Rosario Fadul, and Edward Herold. 1992. "Sosúa Sanky-Pankies and Female Sex Workers." Unpublished manuscript, Instituto de Sexualidad Humana, Universidad Autónoma de Santo Domingo.
- Díaz, Elena, Esperanza Fernández, and Tania Caram. 1996. "Turismo y prostitución en Cuba." Paper presented at the twenty-first annual conference of the Caribbean Studies Association, San Juan, Puerto Rico, May 29.
- Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean. 1999. *Economic*

- Survey of Latin America and the Caribbean, 1998–1999*. Santiago, Chile: United Nations Publication.
- Espinal, Rosario. 1995. "Economic Restructuring, Social Protest, and Democratization in the Dominican Republic." *Latin American Perspectives* 22(3):63–79.
- Fernández, Nadine. 1999. "Back to the Future? Women, Race, and Tourism in Cuba." In Kempadoo 1999, 81–89.
- Fosado, Gisela. In press. "A Woman's Journey into the World of Male Sex Work in Cuba." In *Contemporary Cuba*, ed. Denni Bum and Peter McLaren. Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Freeman, Carla. 2000. *High Tech and High Heels in the Global Economy: Women, Work, and Pink-Collar Identities in the Caribbean*. Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press.
- . 2001. "Is Local : Global as Feminine : Masculine? Rethinking the Gender of Globalization." *Signs* 26(4):1007–37.
- Freitag, Tilman G. 1994. "Enclave Tourism Development: For Whom the Benefits Roll?" *Annals of Tourism Research* 21(3):538–54.
- Fusco, Coco. 1996. "Hustling for Dollars." *Ms.* 7(2):63–70.
- Harrison, David, ed. 1992. *Tourism and the Less Developed Countries*. New York: Wiley.
- Herold, Edward, Rafael García, and Tony De Moya. 2001. "Female Tourists and Beach Boys: Romance or Sex Tourism?" *Annals of Tourism Research* 28(4): 978–97.
- Hodge, G. Derrick. 2001. "Colonization of the Cuban Body: The Growth of Male Sex Work in Havana." *NACLA Report on the Americas* 34(5):20–28.
- Hubbard, Philip. 1999. *Sex and the City: Geographies of Prostitution in the Urban West*. Hants: Ashgate.
- . 2001. "Sex Zones: Intimacy, Citizenship and Public Space." *Sexualities* 4(1):51–71.
- Iyer, Pico. 1995. *Cuba and the Night: A Novel*. New York: Knopf.
- Jiménez, Felucho. 1999. *El turismo en la economía dominicana*. Santo Domingo: Secretaría de Estado de Turismo.
- Kempadoo, Kamala, ed. 1999. *Sun, Sex, and Gold: Tourism and Sex Work in the Caribbean*. Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield.
- LaFranchi, Howard. 1997. "Havana Rolls Out Un-Welcome Mat for Its Country Cousins." *Christian Science Monitor* 89(218):66.
- LeMoncheck, Linda. 1997. *Loose Women, Lecherous Men: A Feminist Philosophy of Sex*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Lladó, Juan. 1996. "El plan nacional de desarrollo turístico." Paper presented at the conference X Convención Nacional y Exposición Comercial, Santo Domingo, September 25–28.
- Lumsden, Ian. 1996. *Machos, Maricones, and Gays: Cuba and Homosexuality*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Martín de Holán, Pablo, and Nelson Phillips. 1997. "Sun, Sand, and Hard Currency: Tourism in Cuba." *Annals of Tourism Research* 24(4):777–95.

- Mesa-Lago, Carmelo, and Jorge Pérez-López. 1999. "Cuba's Economy: Twilight of an Era." *Transition Newsletter* 10(2):22–25.
- Meyerowitz, Joanne. 1990. "Sexual Geography and Gender Economy: The Furnished Room Districts of Chicago, 1890–1930." *Gender and History* 2(3): 274–96.
- Miolán, Angel. 1994. *Turismo: Nuestra industria sin chimeneas*. Santo Domingo: Editorial Letras de Quisqueya.
- Mullings, Beverly. 1999. "Globalization, Tourism, and the International Sex Trade." In Kempadoo 1999, 55–80.
- Olmo, Rosa del. 1979. "The Cuban Revolution and the Struggle against Prostitution." *Crime and Social Justice* 12 (Winter): 34–40.
- Oppermann, Martin. 1999. "Sex Tourism." *Annals of Tourism Research* 26(2): 251–66.
- Orozco, Manuel. 2002. "Attracting Remittances: Market, Money, and Reduced Costs." Unpublished manuscript, report commissioned by the Multilateral Investment Fund of the Inter-American Development Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Paternostro, Silvana. 2000. "Communism versus Prostitution: Sexual Revolution." *New Republic* 4:18–22. Available online at <http://www.tnr.com/071000/paternostro071000.html>.
- Peraza Hebra, Rosa María, Gelsy Villanueva Samon, and María Bazán Pino. 1997. "Promiscuidad, VIH+-SIDA y rehabilitación en el Sanatorio de Atención SIDA Habana." Photocopy. Paper presented at the Encuentro Mariposas I, Centro Cristiano de Reflexión y Diálogo, Cárdenas, Cuba, November 29.
- Petchesky, Rosalind Pollack. 1995. "The Body as Property: A Feminist Re-Vision." In *Conceiving the New World Order: The Global Politics of Reproduction*, ed. Faye D. Ginsburg and Rayna Rapp, 387–406. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- . 2000. "Sexual Rights: Inventing a Concept, Mapping an International Practice." In *Framing the Sexual Subject: The Politics of Gender, Sexuality, and Power*, ed. Richard Parker, Regina Maria Barbosa, and Peter Aggleton, 81–103. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Phillips, Joan L. 1999. "Tourist-Oriented Prostitution in Barbados: The Case of the Beach Boy and the White Female Tourist." In Kempadoo 1999, 183–200.
- Poon, Auliana. 1990. "Flexible Specialization and Small Size: The Case of Caribbean Tourism." *World Development* 18(1):109–23.
- Portes, Alejandro, Manuel Castells, and Lauren A. Benton, eds. 1989. *The Informal Economy: Studies in Advanced and Less Developed Countries*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Portes, Alejandro, and Richard Schauffler. 1993. "Competing Perspectives on the Latin American Informal Sector." *Population and Development Review* 19(1): 33–60.
- Pruitt, Deborah, and Suzanne LaFont. 1995. "Love and Money: Romance Tourism in Jamaica." *Annals of Tourism Research* 22(2):422–40.

- Puar, Jasbir Kaur. 2001. "Global Circuits: Transnational Sexualities and Trinidad." *Signs* 26(4):1039–65.
- ¿Quién diablos es Juliette? (*Who the Hell Is Juliette?*) 1998. Directed and produced by Carlos Marcovich. Mexico City: Instituto Mexicano de Cinematografía. United States video and DVD release: Kino Video, New York.
- Rosen, Ruth. 1982. *The Lost Sisterhood: Prostitution in America, 1900–1918*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Rothschild, Cynthia. 2000. *Written Out: How Sexuality Is Used to Attack Women's Organizing*. San Francisco: International Gay and Lesbian Human Rights Commission.
- Ryan, Chris. 2000. "Sex Tourism: Paradigms of Confusion?" In *Tourism and Sex: Culture, Commerce, and Coercion*, ed. Stephen Clift and Simon Carter, 23–40. London: Cassell.
- Sánchez Taylor, Jacqueline. 2001. "Dollars Are a Girl's Best Friend? Female Tourists' Sexual Behavior in the Caribbean." *Sociology* 35(3):749–64.
- Sassen, Saskia. 1998. *Globalization and Its Discontents: Essays on the New Mobility of People and Money*. New York: New York University Press.
- Schwartz, Rosalie. 1997. *Pleasure Island: Tourism and Temptation in Cuba*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.
- Señor, Luis. 1989. *Código penal dominicano anotado, 1865–1985*. Santo Domingo: Empresión Editoria Unión.
- Sierra i Fabra, Jordi. 1997. *Cuba: La noche de la jinetera*. Barcelona: Ediciones del Bronce.
- Stanley, David. 2000. *Lonely Planet: Cuba*. Hawthorne, Australia: Lonely Planet.
- Stansell, Christine. 1986. *City of Women: Sex and Class in New York, 1789–1860*. New York: Knopf.
- Susman, Paul. 1998. "Cuban Socialism in Crisis: A Neoliberal Solution?" In *Globalization and Neoliberalism: The Caribbean Context*, ed. Thomas Klak, 179–208. Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield.
- United Nations Economic and Social Council. 2000. "Commission on Human Rights, Fifty-Sixth Session, Item 12(a) of the Provisional Agenda E/CN.4/2000/68/Add.2, 8 February." Report. United Nations, New York.
- Wallace, Rebecca. 1997. "Beijing Declaration: Platform for Action." In *International Human Rights Text and Materials*, ed. Rebecca Wallace, 47–130. London: Sweet & Maxwell.
- Wiarda, Howard. 1999. "Leading the World from the Caribbean: The Dominican Republic." *Hemisphere* 2000 7(4). Available online at <http://www.csis.org/americas/pubs/hemvii4.html>.
- Wonders, Nancy A., and Raymond Michalowski. 2001. "Bodies, Borders, and Sex Tourism in a Globalized World: A Tale of Two Cities—Amsterdam and Havana." *Social Problems* 48(4):545–71.
- Wood, Robert E. 2000. "Caribbean Cruise Tourism: Globalization at Sea." *Annals of Tourism Research* 27(2):345–70.
- World Bank. 2000. *Dominican Republic Social and Structural Policy Review*. Vol.

1. Report 20192. Washington, D.C.: World Bank, Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Unit, Latin America and the Caribbean. Available online at <http://inweb18.worldbank.org/External/lac/lac.nsf/cbaf58f>.
- . 2001. *World Development Indicators*. Washington, D.C.: World Bank. Available online at <http://www.worldbank.org/data/wdi2001/index.htm>.
- World Tourism Organization (WTO). 2000. "International Tourism Arrivals and Tourism Receipts by Country of Destination." Available online at <http://www.world-tourism.org>.